JOINT MUNICIPAL WASTE MANAGEMENT STRATEGY REVIEW: ISSUES AND OPTIONS WDA/08/10

Recommendation

That:

Members agree the short list of options for the JMWMS in Table 1, the mechanisms for delivery of the options in Table 2 and the areas for further exploration in Table 3 of this report which will be taken forward as part of the next phase of the JMWMS process.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK

JOINT MUNICIPAL WASTE MANAGEMENT STRATEGY REVIEW: ISSUES AND OPTIONS WDA/08/10

Report of the Director

1. Purpose of the Report

- 1.1 To advise members on the progress made to date to identify the issues and developing options for the review of the Joint Municipal Waste Management Strategy for Merseyside (JMWMS).
- 1.2 To advise members of the outputs from the officer and member workshops held in March 2010 on the proposed options, the mechanisms to deliver those options and other areas suggested for further analysis as detailed in the JMWMS Issues and Options Interim Study report.
- 1.3 Members are reminded that the over-riding objective of the reviewed strategy will be that it can deliver positive outcomes for Merseyside whilst ensuring services are provided efficiently, without excessive cost and can demonstrate value for money.

2. Background

- 2.1 Members considered and agreed a report (WDA 08/09) for the funded programme of projects for the strategy review. Members were further advised of progress in November 2009 (WDA 40/09) and that work to develop issues and options would include engagement with officers and Members early in 2010.
- 2.2 Initial modelling work was undertaken by MWDA to illustrate likely levels of performance, participation and material capture required to meet recycling targets of 44%, 55% and 70%. MWDA then commissioned an Issues and Options study which was awarded to SKM Enviros in December 2009. The MWDA modelling has been incorporated into the Enviros study.
- 2.3 The Interim Study report (Appendix 3) considers the key drivers for the strategy in the current policy and legislative context in order to short list key

Merseyside Waste Disposal Authority 16th April 2010

strategic options and the mechanisms for delivery by the Merseyside and Halton Waste Partnership, other stakeholders and residents of Merseyside. It also considers the review in the context of the on-going PFI procurement process for residual waste treatment infrastructure. The project therefore, specifically focuses on the issues and options associated with the top three levels of the waste hierarchy i.e. waste prevention, re-use, recycling and composting, whilst recognising the impact of these activities on the amount of residual waste ultimately requiring treatment or disposal.

- 2.4 The Final Study report will also take into account the outputs from the Waste Composition Analysis (March-August 2010) and the development of environmental options from the Strategic Environmental Assessment being conducted. A final version of the Issues and Options study will be produced in autumn 2010.
- 2.5 The interim study reviewed current and proposed policy, legislation and other strategic documents and produced a long list of thirty three themes which were identified for consideration (Appendix 1).
- 2.6 Elected Members and Senior Officers with responsibility for waste management across the Merseyside and Halton Waste Partnership were invited to workshops held on 2nd and 9th March 2010 which were used to present the initial findings of the study and to gather opinion and agreement on the proposed list of options, mechanisms for delivery other strategic considerations.
- 2.7 Members are reminded that Halton Borough Council made a decision to proceed with a separate but aligned Strategy review. MWDA and Halton have agreed to work together on specific common tasks and tenders including the Issues and Options. Halton will make use of the baseline information from this interim study to inform the development of their own review.

3. Senior Officers Workshop

3.1 At the first workshop, Senior Officers were asked to review and rank the long list of thirty three themes in terms of high, medium or low priority. Recommendations were made on grouping of themes and two additional themes of affordability and deliverability were taken into consideration in the final analysis. The results of this ranking can be seen in Appendix 2.

- 3.3 Target setting was also discussed and officers identified a range of targets and issues that they considered important. Officers agreed that priority should be given to waste prevention targets although a zero waste target was not favoured at this stage. Equally a 70% recycling target was considered difficult to achieve in a highly populated urban environment. It was proposed that the statutory targets coming from the EU Waste Framework Directive and the Regional Spatial Strategy may be the most appropriate resulting in the 50-55% range for a recycling target. Officers also took the view that carbon targets should be considered which could relate to reduction in carbon footprints, ecological footprints or CO2 emissions generated by waste management activities. Further work would be required to establish a common method of calculation and assessment.
- 3.5 A shortlist of outcome based options and mechanisms for delivery were agreed for presentation to the Members workshop.

4. Members Workshop

- 4.1 The key purpose of the Members workshop was to review the outputs from the officers' workshop (the short list of options, the list of mechanisms for delivery and other strategic considerations).
- 4.2 Members who attended the workshop were asked to consider the shortlist of options (Table 1 below), mechanisms for delivery (Table 2 below) and areas for further exploration (Table 3 below). Members deemed that these lists were acceptable and suitable to take forwards for more detailed analysis. Members were also content to consult on these lists although methods of consultation, engaging with "hard to reach" communities and appropriate phrasing of questions were considered important in terms of the outcome of the consultation. Feedback was also given that questions should attempt to gauge tolerance levels to proposed changes to systems and methods of delivery and also to be mindful of raising public expectations. Proposals to take forward the public consultation will be put before Members for consideration at the Authority meeting in June 2010. Other areas of agreement included:
 - Additional work to assess the carbon impacts of the strategy will be required;
 - A review of the cost benefits of different delivery options as the strategy progresses;

- Value for Money, Deliverability and Affordability should be retained as cross cutting evaluation criteria against all the options;
- A minimum target of 50% recycling should be achievable by 2030 (the lifetime of the strategy).
- 4.3 When considering the other strategic considerations category, members agreed that approaches to joint working and a review of the Levy mechanism and its role in incentivising performance and achieving targets should be explored. The exploration of joint working initiatives could include:
 - Creation of Joint Waste Authorities (various combinations);
 - Joint contract procurement and related opportunities for sharing of facilities, collection round optimisation and efficiency savings;
 - Common service provision e.g. all on Alternate Weekly Collections/comingled collection of recyclates/food waste.
 - Common policies between Councils on waste collection services and developing a common communication strategy and resources sharing.;

5. Risk Implications

Identified	Likelihood	Consequence	Risk	Mitigation
Risk	Rating	Rating	Value	
Risk Failure to agree the options and mechanisms for delivery resulting in inability to go out to public consultation and significant delay in partnership signing up to a revised JMWMS.	Rating 2	Rating 4	8 8	Robust methodology and evidence base to develop options. Engagement with members and officers to consider and agree list of options and further analysis. Agreement by members on questions going to
				public consultation

6. HR Implications

6.1 There are no HR implications associated with this report

7. Environmental Implications

7.1 There is a related Sustainability Appraisal and statutory Strategic Environmental Assessment being conducted to assess the environmental impacts of the options being considered which will feed into the public consultation for the Strategy review.

8. Financial Implications

8.1 Affordability and Value for Money will be key evaluation criteria for the more detailed assessment of the options and mechanisms for delivery as the strategy review progresses. Costs for a range of public consultation options for the strategy review will be put to Members at the Authority Meeting in June 2010.

9. Conclusion

9.1 The final short list of options as agreed by elected members at the Issues and Options workshops is as follows:

Table 1: Short List of Options

Number (not ranked)	Option
1	Reduce the climate change/carbon impacts of waste management
2	Maximise prevention of waste
3	Maximise landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste
4	Maximise sustainable economic activity associated with waste management
5	Reduce the ecological footprint of waste management activities
6	Promote behavioural/cultural change that delivers the strategy objectives
7	Promote the use of renewable energy
8	Achieve high recycling = 50-55%
9	Promote resource efficiency

10	Provide sufficient capacity for waste management activity

9.2 The list of delivery mechanisms elected members agreed should be considered further is as follows:

Table 2: Mechanisms for Delivery

Waste Prevention

Enforcement of policies such as HWRC Permit scheme, no side waste

Restricting residual waste capacity and collection frequency

Lobbying government and working with retailers

Waste prevention activities in schools, commercial waste generators and in house

Incentives for waste prevention

Promotion of activities such as junk mail, real nappies, home composting – overall promotion of behavioural change

Focus on food waste prevention (e.g. Love Food Hate Waste campaign)

Sign up to Zero Waste Places Standard

Re-Use

Charging for bulky waste collections

Support for reuse/refurbishment activity through separate collections, sorting of bulky waste collections, encouraging HWRC based schemes, involvement of third sector

Support the third sector in bulky waste collections and bulky waste deconstruction schemes

Re-use campaigning and promotion e.g. Swap Days, Freecycle/Freegle

In house activity – removal of single use cups, use of milk bottles, rechargeable battery units

Lobbying government, working with local retailers and commercial producers.

Recycling and Composting

Separate food waste collections (household and trade)

Incentives to recycle e.g. reduced container capacity for residual waste, Alternate Weekly Collections, increased recycling capacity, high frequency of recycling collection

Recyclable only HWRCs/Trade only HWRCs

Full coverage of collection schemes and maximised bring bank provision

In house recycling schemes

9

Expand range of dry recyclables collected

Cardboard, colour separated glass, aerosols, foil, plastic film, tetrapack, WEEE, batteries

Provision of recycling services for all waste streams, trade, litter recycling (on street bins), street cleansing.

9.3 Other strategic areas which elected members agreed could be explored further are as follows:

Table 3: Areas for Further Exploration

Review of the Levy mechanism and its role in incentivising performance and achieving targets.

The range of options for future Governance structures including the creation of a Joint Waste Authority (various combinations)

Joint contract procurement and related opportunities for sharing of facilities, collection round optimisation and efficiency savings

Common service provision e.g. all Councils on Alternate Weekly Collections, co-mingled collection of recyclates, food waste collections.

Common policies between Councils on waste collection services and developing a common communication strategy and resource sharing.

The contact officer for this report is: Stuart Donaldson 6th Floor, North House 17, North John Street Liverpool L2 5QY

Email: stuart.donaldson@merseysidewda.gov.uk Tel: 0151 255 2570 Fax: 0151 255 0010

The background documents to this report are open to inspection in accordance with Section 100D of The Local Government Act 1972: Appendix A: JMWMS Issues and Options Study

APPENDIX 1 – Summary of Key Themes

(Source: JMWMS Issues and Options Study Interim Report 2010)

Waste re-use and remanufacturing	Key Themes
Reduction of climate change/carbon impacts Low carbon economic activity Protection of natural resources Sustainable communities Sustainable waste management De-coupling of economic growth and waste growth/impacts Reduce the carbon impacts of waste management The waste hierarchy Waste prevention Waste prevention Waste re-use and remanufacturing Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development	Resource efficiency
Low carbon economic activity Protection of natural resources Sustainable communities Sustainable waste management De-coupling of economic growth and waste growth/impacts Reduce the carbon impacts of waste management The waste hierarchy Waste prevention Waste prevention Waste re-use and remanufacturing Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Sustainable consumption and production
Protection of natural resources Sustainable communities Sustainable waste management De-coupling of economic growth and waste growth/impacts Reduce the carbon impacts of waste management The waste hierarchy Waste prevention Waste re-use and remanufacturing Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Reduction of climate change/carbon impacts
Sustainable communities Sustainable waste management De-coupling of economic growth and waste growth/impacts Reduce the carbon impacts of waste management The waste hierarchy Waste prevention Waste re-use and remanufacturing Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Low carbon economic activity
Sustainable waste management De-coupling of economic growth and waste growth/impacts Reduce the carbon impacts of waste management The waste hierarchy Waste prevention Waste re-use and remanufacturing Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Pronoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Protection of natural resources
De-coupling of economic growth and waste growth/impacts Reduce the carbon impacts of waste management The waste hierarchy Waste prevention Waste re-use and remanufacturing Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Sustainable communities
Reduce the carbon impacts of waste management The waste hierarchy Waste prevention Waste re-use and remanufacturing Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Sustainable waste management
The waste hierarchy Waste prevention Waste prevention Waste re-use and remanufacturing Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	De-coupling of economic growth and waste growth/impacts
Waste preventionWaste re-use and remanufacturingZero wasteHigh recycling = 60-70%High recycling = 50-55%Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual wasteConsideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE)InnovationEnergy efficiencyRenewable energy generationReducing transport ImpactsReducing the ecological footprintImportance of partnership working & working togetherProvision of sufficient capacity for waste management activityPromotion of key waste messages & awareness raisingProvision of efficient servicesPromoting behavioural/cultural changeSelf sufficiency and the proximity principleSustainable procurementLeading by exampleMarket developmentHealthy, safe and prosperous communities	Reduce the carbon impacts of waste management
Waste re-use and remanufacturingZero wasteHigh recycling = 60-70%High recycling = 50-55%Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual wasteConsideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE)InnovationEnergy efficiencyRenewable energy generationReducing transport ImpactsReducing the ecological footprintImportance of partnership working & working togetherProvision of sufficient capacity for waste management activityPromotion of key waste messages & awareness raisingProvision of efficient servicesPromoting behavioural/cultural changeSelf sufficiency and the proximity principleSustainable procurementLeading by exampleMarket developmentHealthy, safe and prosperous communities	The waste hierarchy
Zero waste High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Waste prevention
High recycling = 60-70% High recycling = 50-55% Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Waste re-use and remanufacturing
High recycling = 50-55%Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual wasteConsideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE)InnovationEnergy efficiencyRenewable energy generationReducing transport ImpactsReducing the ecological footprintImportance of partnership working & working togetherProvision of sufficient capacity for waste management activityPromotion of key waste messages & awareness raisingProvision of efficient servicesPromoting behavioural/cultural changeSelf sufficiency and the proximity principleSustainable procurementLeading by exampleMarket developmentHealthy, safe and prosperous communities	Zero waste
Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	High recycling = 60-70%
Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE) Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	High recycling = 50-55%
Innovation Energy efficiency Renewable energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Landfill diversion/ recovery of residual waste
Energy efficiency Energy generation Reducing transport Impacts Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Consideration of all waste streams (MSW, C&I, C&DE)
Renewable energy generationReducing transport ImpactsReducing the ecological footprintImportance of partnership working & working togetherProvision of sufficient capacity for waste management activityPromotion of key waste messages & awareness raisingProvision of efficient servicesPromoting behavioural/cultural changeSelf sufficiency and the proximity principleSustainable procurementLeading by exampleMarket developmentHealthy, safe and prosperous communities	Innovation
Reducing transport ImpactsReducing the ecological footprintImportance of partnership working & working togetherProvision of sufficient capacity for waste management activityPromotion of key waste messages & awareness raisingProvision of efficient servicesPromoting behavioural/cultural changeSelf sufficiency and the proximity principleSustainable procurementLeading by exampleMarket developmentHealthy, safe and prosperous communities	Energy efficiency
Reducing the ecological footprint Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Renewable energy generation
Importance of partnership working & working together Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Reducing transport Impacts
Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Reducing the ecological footprint
Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Importance of partnership working & working together
Provision of efficient services Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Provision of sufficient capacity for waste management activity
Promoting behavioural/cultural change Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Promotion of key waste messages & awareness raising
Self sufficiency and the proximity principle Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Provision of efficient services
Sustainable procurement Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Promoting behavioural/cultural change
Leading by example Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Self sufficiency and the proximity principle
Market development Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Sustainable procurement
Healthy, safe and prosperous communities	Leading by example
	Market development
Value for money	Healthy, safe and prosperous communities
	Value for money



APPENDIX 2: Ranking of Themes – High Priority Scores

Source: JMWMS Issues and Options Study Interim Report 2010

APPENDIX 3: JMWMS Issues and Options Study Interim Report 2010.

SEE ATTACHED